The Organ Historical Society
Box 26811, Richmond, Virginia 23261
(804)353-9226
OHS Organ Archive at Westminster Choir College,
Princeton, New Jersey

The National Council
Officers and Councillors (all terms expire 1991)

Roy Redman ........................................ President
Kristin Gunning Farmer ..................... Vice President
John Panning ............................... Councillor for Conventions
Jerry D. Morton ....................... Councillor for Finance & Development
John K. Ogasapian ....................... Councillor for Organizational Concerns
Michael B. Hoerig ....................... 1990 Convention Chair
Craig J. Cramer, Wm. P. Hays, David M. Storey, 1991 Convention Chair

OHS Staff
William T. Van Pelt ......................... Executive Director
Jerry D. Morton .......................... Managing Editor
F. Robert Roche ......................... Advertising Manager
William T. Van Pelt ................ Production
Robert Guenther ......................... Production
Stephen Pinel, William Van Pelt ....... Editorial Review

Committees
Julie Stephens ............................... Biggs Fellowship
David M. Storey ......................... Recital Series
Michael Schmitt ......................... Newsletter, Editor, and Annual Membership

Membership Address
Alan Laufman 
Box 104, Hartsville, NH 03640

Central New York, 1976

Chicago Midwest, 1980

Eastern Iowa, 1982

Greater New York City, 1969

Greater St. Louis, 1975

Hilbus (Washington-Baltimore), 1970

Mid-Hudson (New York), 1978

New Orleans, 1963

Pacific-Northwest, 1976

Pacific-Southwest, 1978

South Carolina, 1979

South Texas (The San Antonio Pipe Organ Society), 1977, 1981

Tannenberg (Central Pa.), 1976

Wisconsin, 1988

THE TRACKER® is published four times a year by the Organ Historical Society, Inc., a non-profit, educational organization.

Annual membership dues, including THE TRACKER®, regular members $25.00 (over age 65, full-time students, and additional member in a household $20.00); Contributing members $35.00; Sustaining members $50.00; Patrons $1,000.00; Benefactors $250.00. Institutions and businesses may be non-voting subscribers at the same rates.

Advertising in no way implies OHS endorsement of goods or services. The Organ Historical Society, Inc. cannot be returned. Material published in THE TRACKER may not be reproduced without permission of the Editor.

THE ORGAN HISTORICAL SOCIETY is not obligated to any commercial interest. There is no intention to discredit or recommend any existing organ manufacturer or concern. No such material implied, or construed in any form may be used in advertising or for any commercial purpose. The Society will take all steps to prevent or prosecute any such use of its material, the name THE TRACKER, or the name THE ORGAN HISTORICAL SOCIETY. THE TRACKER® is a registered trademark. Copyright ©1969 The Organ Historical Society, Inc. ISSN: 0041-0330.
Identifying A Thomas Hall Organ .......................... 13
John Ogasapian Assembles Evidence to Attribute an Organ in Milton, Connecticut

Two Pupils of Rheinberger & Their Use of the Organ in St. John Passion .......................... 19
Robin A. Leaver Describes the First American Performance of Bach's St. John Passion
As Mounted by Rheinberger Pupil John Frederick Wolle of Bethlehem, Pennsylvania

The New York Organs of George W. Earle .......................... 25
Judith A. Schneider Sketches a Biography of the Organbuilder And
Describes Examples of His Work In Sag Harbor, New York, and Island Pond, Vermont

Howe Barrel Organ Restored at Cooperstown .......................... 30
Kathryn Boardman Describes a Barrel Organ by William Howe of New York
That Served the Family of Novelist James Fenimore Cooper

DEPARTMENTS
Letters ................................................................. 4
Reviews ............................................................. 7
Strong on Music, A 19th Century Diary Edited by Vera Brodsky Lawrence, Reviewed by John Ogasapian
The Instruments of Samuel Green, Reviewed by John Speller
Organ Dictionary, Reviewed by Albert F. Robinson
A Recording by Arno Schoenstedt, Ein Organistenportrait, Reviewed by Karl Loveland
A Recording by James Higdon, Organ Music of France, Reviewed by Thomas Dressler

Obituaries ......................................................... 12

The Organ Extinct?

"THOUGH THE MIGHTY PIPE ORGANS have all but disappeared, Reader's Digest found sixteen of these glorious instruments . . . ." These carefully chosen and poorly researched words describe The Mighty Pipe Organ Plays Golden Favorites, a cassette produced by the Reader's Digest Association and advertised for sale on page 40 of its spring catalog.

What a comfort to realize that the Reader's Digest Association finds organ music a profitable commodity! How distressing that organizations, concert halls, and church music committees? Unfortu­nately, many people will act in consonance with this misimpression created or reinforced by Reader's Digest. Being so highly regarded, the Reader's Digest Association enjoys a strong position to influence people; it is in the business of selling this tremendous power of communication to advertisers for more than $100,000 per page of its magazine—the cost of a modest two-manual organ. If the magazine were not effective in moving people to act in a certain way, advertisers would not pay this price. In fact, the folks at Reader's Digest know their magazine is powerful for they boast "We Move More Americans" in their own advertising to media buyers who read Standard Rates & Data. In Volume 70, Number 10, of that compilation of magazine advertising data, the Reader's Digest Association advertises that 51 million readers of Reader's Digest place its audience between the two top-rated national television programs. For comparison, consider that Time magazine has 4.6 million readers, only nine percent of the number who read Reader's Digest.

The OHS, Associated Pipe Organ Builders of America, American Institute of Organbuilders, and AGO have corresponded with officials at Reader's Digest who have agreed to change the advertising copy but have made no commitment to reduce the public misimpressions their words created or otherwise redress the wrong perpetrated.

We believe that a carefully researched article about pipe organs would be of interest to readers of Reader's Digest and would go a long way toward redressing the damage inflicted by the publishers of this most respected of general readership magazines. OHS members who wish to share their thoughts on this matter may write to Mr. George V. Grune, Chairman and Chief Executive Officer, The Reader's Digest Association, Inc., Pleasantville, NY 10570. My letter to Mr. Grune is "digested" below.

Dear Mr. Grune:

Millions of readers have been misinformed regarding the continued existence and burgeoning manufacture of pipe organs by the phrase "Though the mighty pipe organs have all but disappeared . . . ." in advertisements for the audio cassette produced by Reader's Digest. . . .

The Organ Historical Society conducts an ongoing inventory of pipe organs in the United States. Because many hundreds of pipe organs are produced yearly and literally tens of thousands of them built after 1900 are still in use, the Organ Historical Society has (until recently) confined its inventory to 4,512 extant instruments built before 1900. Also, we know of at least 200 firms engaged in the manufacture of pipe organs in the United States.

Clearly, Reader's Digest has misinformed its public. Correction of the advertising copy will not be adequate to correct the millions of misimpressions already created.

. . . . I write to respectfully request that the Reader's Digest Association reverse the misimpressions that it has created. . . .

WTVP

3
LETTERS

Editor:

As chairman of the thirty-fourth annual OHS national convention held this past June in New Orleans, I wish to respond to a few remarks made by Robert Strippy in his letter in 33:1. I am sorry that Mr. Strippy could not be here to hear the beautiful demonstration by Will Headlee of the Jardine organ in St. Joseph's Church. First and foremost, the organ is not "restored" but has been made playable and returned to service by members of the New Orleans Chapter OHS. Although St. Joseph's is located in what is now the heart of the central business district, it conducts two masses per day, several masses each weekend, and a large number of weddings each year; several large ecumenical services, festivals, and musical programs take place there each year, some of which involve choirs, instrumentalists, and large congregations. The organ there was never intended to be a permanent installation in this vast building, but it has served faithfully for at least seventy-five years. Many conventioneers commented about the remarkable beauty and clarity of this organ in the room. In no sense could it be labeled as "utterly unsuitable or lost in the building."

Mr. Strippy also says that many such organs to be heard during the New Orleans convention are located in churches with no active parish. Every church visited by the convention employs an organist and is open regularly for services. As is the case of many inner city churches throughout the country, attendance is down in some instances, but none of these churches could or should be labeled as dead. Only a handful of our hundred or more Catholic churches here even attempt to have a choir or full-scale music program.

One of my jobs as convention chairman was to work directly with each recitalist, matching repertoire to instrument and building. In no single case was I led to believe that any of our recitalists who performed so ably felt "straightjacketed by nine or ten manual stops and single pedal Bourdon." I was amazed at the enthusiasm and pleasure that was shown by every performer for the instrument they played. Each player without exception reflected genuine delight at the opportunity of showing off the available stops on these instruments. As one player commented to me, "It's not what we don't have on this organ, but look what we do have!"

In thumbing through the Organ Handbook for 1989, I do not find any "macaronic pieces from America's primitive period" on the programs. The literature played at the New Orleans convention was representative of some of the finest organ literature encompassing several centuries. Most of our recitalists would be proud to play almost any of the pieces (sacred, of course) from these recitals in our own churches on any given Sunday morning.

As for taking the 1914 Stanley on the Interstate, I think many antique car owners would fare better on the Interstate today than many of us who drive brand new "state of the art'' automobiles being manufactured today.

Rachelen Lien
New Orleans, Louisiana

Editor:

In connection with the Hutchings letters printed in 33:1:21, I would like to call the attention of readers to the illustration of George Hutchings factory which appeared in 30:4:32, accompanying Stephen Pinel's article "A Comparator of American Organ Manufacturing."

The illustration shows very clearly the setting-up room rising from the center of the factory that the Boston authorities forced Hutchings to tear down and rebuild. I thought this illustration would appear with the Hutchings article, but it was omitted for lack of space.

I have recently run across a few other references to George Hutchings in some letters written by William Horatio Clarke:

"I have just received a long letter from Mr. Hutchings giving me the reasons for the failure, from which he thinks the conditions are inclined to be hopeless. I am deeply sorry for him. He says that he was too ambitious and branched out too large after the great loss by fire about three years ago and the attendant expenses of carrying out his contracts under difficulties. He is a good man, but made a mistake in letting the business go into the management of a stock company." (January 8, 1908)
I have two long letters from Mr. Hutchings giving me reasons for causes which led to the disaster. He feels hopeless in regard to any prospects of re-organization. It is a world of tribulation." (January 23, 1908)

"Organ matters are quiet. The Skinner Co. is about closed up, as Mr. S. has been ill for two or three months. The Hutchings-Votey business was closed out by an auction sale of machinery and materials on hand." (June 23, 1908)

"I have heard since then, electric action in large organs has always been the cause of much care and annoyance—and probably it may always be so, from the nature of things. An electrician, not educated in the adaptation of electricity to organ mechanism is utterly useless—so Mr. Hutchings told me on his last friendly visit to me. Ernest M. Skinner was his electrician and superintendent at the time the large organ in St. Bartholomew's Church, NY was built and Mr. H. told me that instead of the nominal price which he estimated for electric action, it had already cost him fifteen thousand dollars in the endeavor to make it work satisfactorily—added to the price received for the organ. No wonder that organ after organ swamped his business, in his ambition to build large organs—as he recently wrote me. It seems to me that the application of electricity to organ building has been a curse to the business, and if I were yet a builder, I would refuse to take a contract for an electric organ." (September 10, 1908)

"Mr. Hastings is yet living, 72 or 73 years of age. The Hutchings-Votey Co. failed and went out of existence, with no one to guarantee their organs. Mr. Hutchings is now associated in a small way with E. W. Lane of Waltham." (February 26, 1909)

"It makes me sad to state that my good friend, Mr. George S. Hutchings, is confined to the house with paresis, and is very feeble. He tried to build up a worthy organ business, but was taken advantage of by unprincipled stockholders and lost the hard earnings of a lifetime. The business is carried on in his name by two brothers named Flaherty, in Waltham, but Mr. H. will be on earth but a short time." (November 7, 1911)

Elizabeth Towne Schmitt
Rolla, Missouri

Editor:

I would like our membership to know about an on-going organ rescue project in the West Indies and ask your support for it.

In 1985 Barbara Owen repaired an 1865 Bevington for the Anglican church in Calliaqua, St. Vincent. In 1988 I went down and dismantled that same organ so that they could pour a concrete loft to replace the sagging wood loft. We stripped and refinished it, soldered up the tuning windows on the front pipes, made a new pedal chest, patched the bellows, and repaired several trackers. I was given eight assistants, and we did the work in less than two weeks. Last February Barbara and I went down together. Barbara repaired an organ on St. Lucia, and then we both dismantled a Hill & Son (2/9) in the Anglican church in Gouyave, Grenada. After Barbara left, I dismantled a Henry Jones (1/5) in the Anglican church in Sauteurs, Grenada.

We have committed ourselves to going to the West Indies once a year (in winter, of course) to try to save and restore as many organs as we can. This is how it works: The parish pays for our passage and for materials, and we donate our time. The organs in the tropics suffer dreadfully from insect invasion and leaky roofs (the result of hurricanes). We show the parishioners how to clean off the keyboards, clean away the old leather from the bellows and from pipe stoppers. We get local carpenters to provide us with mahogany (which insects don't like to eat), and give the parish guidelines for providing the organ with a suitable place to be re-erected. Everyone we've met truly prefers the idea of restoring their pipe organ to buying an electronic organ, and we're always given enthusiastic, grateful, and SKILLED help in our efforts. Just by making a presence there, we give other parishes a reasonable hope that their organ can be restored someday, too. We're given room and board in parishioners' homes (and a Carib Beer each afternoon at 4:00). We are also in the process of finding used North American pipe organs for installation in churches where their own were lost through hurricanes, insect damage, or the recommendation of the Allen salesman. We call our little coalition SWIMIN (Saving West Indian Musical Instruments Now).
I have just received an appeal for help from the Parish of St. John’s, Grenada, where SWIMIN (joined by Dana Hull) will be working next February, re-erecting the ca. 1880 Hill & Son (2/9) pipe organ. I'll quote part of the letter:

Being faced with this problem [necessary organ repairs], which will cost an amount in the vicinity of $12,000 (East Caribbean currency) [about $4,000 US], certainly beyond our reach due to our limited resources, we therefore humbly appeal to our Brothers and Sisters in Christ, both home and abroad, to render some assistance to our Parish, to enable us to achieve our objective.

We pray that by the Grace of Almighty God, the generosity of Friends and Well-wishers, along with our united efforts we will succeed in our endeavor.

I, therefore, ask your financial help, in any amount no matter how small, for St. John’s Parish. They have no wealthy patrons: the organ fund will grow from small contributions by parishioners living at a nearly subsistence level. Our help will not only alleviate their financial distress but will give them a boost in morale. Contrary to what we anticipated, everyone we met welcomed us as Americans and expressed energetic gratitude about the American intervention in their island’s affairs several years ago. They would be moved to know that members of our organization cared about their situation.

You can make your checks payable to St. John’s Anglican Organ Fund (there is no problem with American checks) and forward them to the Archdeacon of Grenada, Church St., St. George’s, Grenada, OR send them to Barbara Owen, 28 Jefferson St., Newburyport, MA 01950.

Susan Tattershall
Rhinebeck, NY

Editor:
May I please request amplification of your printing of the “Minutes” of the Society, October, 1988, wherein it states, “Correspondence has been received from the Curtis Organ Restoration Society asking for OHS evaluation of their organ work . . . . Council voted ‘not to grant the request’ . . . .”

I take no exception to the decision, but I would like it known that the “organ work” referred to is the training program in the West Philadelphia High School involving the restoration of the 33 rank, 1926 F. A. Bartholomay organ. I inaugurated the concept of this restoration and the Curtis Organ Society, under the direction of Kevin Chun, implemented the idea. West Philadelphia High students have learned various phases of organ building by completing the Choir Chamber restoration, utilizing an Austin console donated by the Church of the New Jerusalem, Philadelphia. The original Bartholomay console has been retained until funds are available to repair same to eventually effect an authentic restoration. The Board of Education in Philadelphia has been most supportive in this pilot program.

I point out, therefore, that the “organ work” does not refer to the great restoration involved in the successful result achieved with the Curtis Organ Restoration Society’s efforts with the 161 rank Sesquicentennial Organ in the Irvine Auditorium at the University of Pennsylvania.

With the completion of the restoration of the dual-console Möller in the Civic Auditorium, we now have two major organs within a block of each other in Philadelphia.

Irvin R. Glazer
Restoration Coordinator
Philadelphia Civic Center Organ

Editor:
I was very glad that I could attend the 1989 OHS Convention in New Orleans as an E. Power Biggs Fellow. The Convention far exceeded all of my expectations, which were already high in anticipation. Everything I saw and everybody I talked to had a positive impact on my opinion of the OHS.

I would like to thank the many people who worked so very hard to make this convention a success, those who listened to me, and those who answered my questions. I particularly thank, most of all, those who made it possible for me and the other Biggs Fellows to attend the 1989 Convention.

Marshall D. Foxworthy
Tampa, Florida
REVIEWS


In 1952 Macmillan published a four-volume abridgement of the diaries of George Templeton Strong, mid-nineteenth-century New York lawyer, music lover, churchman, man-about-town, and—to tell the truth—somewhat of a snob. The original copybooks in which he wrote, now in the collection of the New York Historical Society and bound into four leather volumes, totaling 2,250 pages and containing some 4½ million words, begin in the fall of 1835, when Strong was but fifteen, and break off just shy of four weeks before his death on 21 July 1875.

The Macmillan publication's editors, Allan Nevins and Milton Halsey Thomas, were faced with the unenviable task of cutting out enough to make their edition manageable, and among the material they excised was that on music. Their preface acknowledged the necessity as regrettable, but suggested by way of compensation: "... though we give numerous excerpts from his discriminating criticism of concerts, oratorios, and operas, ... an interesting volume of musical comment could—and someday will—be compiled from the diary" (vi:vii).

Yet not until 1975, nearly a quarter-century later, would Ms. Lawrence begin the project that would fulfill their prophecy. And now, more than another decade later, the first volume of that project is in hand. Beyond cavil, it is a magnificent piece of work, fully at the level of scholarship that we have come to expect from her over the years and as fascinating and hard to put down as any fine novel.

Along with Strong's musical entries and her own illuminating commentary year by year, Ms. Lawrence intersperses "obbligato" sections on the musical and cultural life of the city. The book contains numerous illustrations from the period as well as appendices of music theatre productions and of letters, a bibliography and index.

There is material on Thomas Hall and Henry Erben: we learn, for instance, that Erben himself was an organist of some ability, at least by Strong's lights. Some interesting vignettes of the pair occur in Strong's chronicle of the building of his own two-manual residence instrument ("Goliath," as he calls the organ). There are accounts of organ exhibitions and comments at close range on Edward Hodges and his son, G. P. H, on William A. King of Grace Church (a frequent organist for Erben's "exhibitions"), Henry C. Timm of St. Thomas, and Clement Clark Moore of St. Peter's (whose
.playing of that church's large Erben engenders some rather testy reactions).

Strong was a prejudiced but keen observer, and *Resonances* contains incisive if occasionally tart entries by him on a variety of musical topics beyond the organs and church music in which he seemed especially interested—at least from time to time—and about which he was given to especially strong-minded views. Ms. Lawrence's own commentary on the musical scene is elegant and informative, as one might well expect of one with her exhaustive command of her field. Subjects range from operatic and orchestral performances to recitals and concerts, and to Pulter to the Hutchinson Family Singers.

This book is a major work of American musical scholarship, probably the most significant work in the general area of American music to be published in at least the past five years. We may all await with some anticipation the forthcoming volumes of Ms. Lawrence's work.


Samuel Green (1740-1796) enjoyed great prestige in the last quarter of the eighteenth century as organ maker to King George III. Green has not received a particularly good press since his death, largely because his instruments were soft and sweet, perhaps even anemic—a characteristic which he deliberately enhanced by lining his organs throughout with straw and burlap! He was, however, an extremely fine craftsman and an important innovator in the areas of mechanism and winding system of the organ. His use of wider pipescales than had customarily been adopted in the eighteenth century paved the way for some of the tonal developments of the nineteenth century. There is no doubt, therefore, that, whatever we may think of his tonal design (and I, for one, much prefer the work of the Byfields and the Englands), Green deserves to be taken seriously, and a book about him is long overdue.

The importance of Wickens' book lies in the meticulous way it is written, and it could well serve as a model for other books on individual organbuilders. The format of the book is excellent. Chapter One begins with a scholarly discussion of the source materials for a study of Green's instruments, and this leads into a short but succinct biographical section. The second, third, and fourth chapters are devoted respectively to the mechanism, tonal design, and casework of Green's organs. Chapters Five and Six give chronological surveys of extant, authentic Green organs and to spurious instruments erroneously attributed to him.

The detailed research which Wickens has incorporated into Chapters Two through Four is quite stunning. The features of Green's mechanism are not only meticulously described, but he has even researched tooling marks, etc., in order to describe the precise way and even the exact order of the stages by which Green manufactured an organ. Furthermore, not only does Wickens record details of the scaling and voicing of extant Green pipework, but he has even worked out exactly how Green calculated his pipescales for particular acoustical environments. At times Wickens almost seems to enter Green's mind, and he has additionally the ability to communicate this experience to the reader.

Apart from some very unfortunate errors in the illustrations (among other things several plates are printed upside down!), the book is well produced and free of errors. A companion volume by Alan Barnes, *John Snetzler: His Life and Instruments*, is said to be forthcoming. If it is half as good as Wickens' book on Green, it will be well worth reading.

*John L. Speller, Columbia Organ Works, Columbia, Penn.*
Every term pertaining to pipe organs and their construction is contained in this dictionary covering eleven languages: Dutch, English, German, Danish, Swedish, Norwegian, French, Spanish, Catalan, Italian, and Esperanto. In certain instances, definitive distinctions “between British and American English” employ “[Am?]” to modify an indistinguishable expression.

Mr. Praet and his collaborators consulted at least four authorities in each language for each entry. Obvious omissions are Japanese, Gaelic, Russian, etc., where perhaps it is “unlikely that these languages have developed an extensive organ-related vocabulary.”

The handsome book contains a table of contents covering eighteen subjects: people and administration, tools, organ types, position of the organs (divisions), organ cases, wind supply, console, action, sound-boards, non-mechanical actions, faults and breakdowns, pipework, flues, reeds, tuning and voicing, stop types, materials, and measurements. This is followed by an introductory chapter in each of the eleven languages. Then in the bulk of the work, each term is given its corresponding word in all of the languages. Some of these I found amusing: the French tenn for “rebuild” is a word I always associated with a woman’s wig! And a “square” in German is a winkel.

The carefully drawn illustrations demonstrate many organ parts, actions, and cases. A lengthy index in each language contains every term from the text, making it easy to find the related terms in other languages.

For the organbuilder, historian, and traveler, this book is a handy reference for study purposes as well as for general enlightenment.

Albert F. Robinson, Peekskill, New York

Arno Schönetedt: Ein Orgelorganportrait. Works of J.S. Bach, Mendelssohn, David, and Distler, on organs built by Marcussen & Sohn, Hammer, and Ott. Pape OP 5001, CD available for $19.99, plus $2.00 postage, from the Organ Literature Foundation, 45 Norfolk Road, Braintree, MA 02184.

The practice of placing the performance of various works on different instruments by one artist on a single disc is a concept that has recently been used to a positive end. It provides the listener with a variety of sonic experiences and renders a point of comparison among builders; and, of course, different instruments are more or less appropriate for different works. For the organ-recording buff as well as for study purposes as well as for general enlightenment.

Consider the Cost of Poor Quality.

You will spend the price of a new automobile, or more, to leather or re-leather your current organ, the replacement value of which rivals that of a new home.

Beyond good design lies the consideration of good construction.

Whether you’re buying a new or rebuilt organ, insist on PIPECRAFT CERTIFIED LEATHERS. Our carefully controlled high chrome tanning processes now with G.A.* to resist atmospheric acids, help ensure the longevity of your new or rebuilt organ.

*Glutar Aldehyde

We want the best for your organ: insist on PIPECRAFT CERTIFIED LEATHERS.

CLASSIFIED ADVERTISING

WANTED TO BUY: Regina music boxes and other types of musical boxes, musical clocks, Steinhaw Grand player piano. Call Jim Brady collect 317/259-4307 or write 2725 E. 56th St., Indianapolis, IN 46220.


FOR SALE — 100 pipe organs, mostly old, with mechanical action; all sizes and varying conditions. Send $5.00 in stamps for list. Some electro-pneumatic and late-model instruments also available. Alan Laufman, Executive Director, Organ Clearing House, P. O. Box 104, Harrisville, NH 03450.
carried out with exacting results in this performance. In some of the later variations, which require more nimble fingerwork, the playing is a little less lucid and one occasionally hears a brushed note or in this offering. I had to listen twice to make sure the Posaune was Christuskirche is not shown to be a particularly thrilling instrument two. The three-manual Paul Ott organ (1960) in the Recklinghaus used as indicated in the Distler score.

Many compact discs on the market today offering a pot pourri of an artist's previously recorded performances use the length of the disc as a selling point—"over seventy minutes of music." Perhaps if the producers here had included another work—there is plenty of disc space left—this offering could be considered a find. As it is, with just over fifty minutes playing time, this recording is rather routine in both performance and recorded quality. Additionally, the instruments are more alike in tonal quality than different. Considering the historical distance between the works presented here, over two hundred years, perhaps more diversity between instruments would have been appropriate. The program notes have detailed listings of the nomenclature of the instruments and black-and-white photographs of the instruments. The material concerning the performer, composers, and their works is brief and in German with no English translation. Karl Loveland Eastman School of Music, Rochester, NY


"You can't judge a book by its cover." Nowhere is it more true than in the world of compact discs. I'm sure we have all passed up some recording with an uninteresting cover in favor of some more interesting looking (and expensive!) package, to later find out the recording we bought was the uninteresting one and the one we passed up was very good. The present recording is based on an excellent concept and is an interesting package, but the prospective buyer should be aware of some of its drawbacks before eagerly rushing out to buy it.

The instrument chosen for this recording is a Cavallé-Coll organ of forty-five stops on three manuals and pedal, built in 1879 for Saint-François-de-Sales Church in Lyon. According to the notes, the organ has not been altered in any way except for the addition of an electric blower. The instrument presents us with a wonderful palette of sounds. Some descriptive words which come to my mind are rich, majestic, smooth, lyric, delicate and clear. These words, of course, are much abused in descriptive writing, so it is difficult to give a clear impression of the sound of this instrument. Perhaps it will suffice for me simply to say it is a special instrument.

Though words cannot convey a clear impression of sound, a compact disc should be able to do so. However, in this case, the sound is disappointing compared to other organ recordings released lately. While listening to this recording, I constantly found myself feeling as though I was sitting in a bad place to hear the instrument and would like to move somewhere else. The notes are obscured to the point that one is not able to hear what they are, and sometimes the balances are not quite right. It is difficult to say whether the fault lies entirely with the recording itself or with the playing. My initial reaction was that the playing was not sympathetic to the surrounding acoustics, but I am willing to divide the blame, since I find it hard to believe a performer could be so insensitive to what seems like good acoustics.

I found the quality of the performances on this disc to be poor. The first piece on this recording is the Improvisation on "Victime paschali laudes" by Charles Tournemire. I assume it was placed first on this disc in order to make an impression, but I must say the impression I received was not a good one. After listening to the rest of the disc, I returned to the Tournemire armed with a score to check my convictions and my impression became even worse. The reasons for this will take some explanation.

The most outstanding feature of the interpretations on this disc is the arbitrary use of tempo rubato. For the French, tempo rubato has always meant a tasteful freedom within a strict rhythmic structure. This can be seen in old sources such as Couperin and Quantz as well as in modern recordings of French organists. André Marchal, who had personal contact with many of the great French organists, used large rubatos, yet with such smoothness of taste that the listener was not fully aware the beat was being modified. This is how it should be; rubato is meant to enhance the musical effect, not to draw attention to itself as a performance device.

On this recording, however, the use of rubato is so arbitrary and prominent that the listener feels pulled and pushed along as if on a roller coaster. There are times when it is difficult to feel the tempo because it is constantly changing; at times it seems as if there is a tempo established, and then it feels as if the floor drops when the tempo suddenly changes. This effect is intensified by the lack of clarity in the playing and the recording.

This reaction could be called subjective, but the Tournemire Improvisation on "Victime paschali" provides an objective basis for this judgement. When Maurice Duruflé wrote down the Tournemire improvisations, he was very explicit regarding the tempo and tempo changes he heard on the original recordings. The performer interested in learning about tempo rubato could use these scores as a fascinating study, but in this recording the performer carelessly disregards the indications in the score. In measure three the tempo changes from moderato to largo and then a rallentando is indicated. To my utter amazement, this performance has a slight accelerando in this spot! On page 32 there is another rallentando indicated at the end of the second line, and again he speeds up! This lack of attention to the score is not limited to tempo changes; on page 28 at the end of the second line, for example, there is a dotted note which is not allowed to speak its full value. These are only a few examples of a number of cases of utter disregard for the score.

The rest of the pieces on this disk also suffer from this approach, though they do not seem to be as carelessly played as the Tournemire "Victime paschali laudes." In the "Cantilene improvisée" of Tournemire it is sometimes difficult to discern the basic tempo of the piece because the rubatos are almost out of control. The initial notes of melodic lines are drawn out to the extreme and then the line rushes to "catch up." While one could say this is how rubato is generally done, when it is taken to extremes as it is here, the form of the lines becomes almost unintelligible.

French composers of the late Romantic period often took advantage of the acoustics of large French churches by writing pieces in arpeggiated style. In these pieces the composers often capitalized on the fact that the highest notes in these figures would "hang in the air" for awhile, and would form a melodic line of their own. On this recording there are two pieces which take advantage of this effect: the "Prelude" of the Pierné Trois Pièces, and the "Prelude in G minor" of Marcel Dupré. Unfortunately, these pieces are played in such a tense and rushed manner that these lines are impossible to hear. The effect of the Dupré, in particular, is that of a muddle of sound "without form or void."

In my opinion, the best playing on this disc is that of the "Scherzando" from the Pierné Trois Pièces, Opus 29. Here the playing is more clear than usual, though even this piece sounds rushed.

The concept of this recording is excellent: Tournemire, Pierné, Brraine and Duruflé played on a basically unchanged Cavallé-Coll organ. The recording is disappointing, however, from the musical standpoint. And even if one simply wants to hear the sounds of the instrument the recording is still disappointing because of the lack of clarity in the playing and the recorded sound. Thomas Dressler, St. Cecilia's Church, Iselin, N.J. 10
ARCHIVIST'S REPORT

AT THEIR OCTOBER MEETING, the National Council authorized an appraisal of the American Organ Archive to update the records of the Society. According to the September 1988 report of the treasurer, the total value of the collection was $3,142.44. This appraisal was done about 1982 by Homer Blanchard. A new appraisal, completed by E. A. Boadway in May and June 1989, reassesses the value of the collection at $425,000.00. The unprecedented growth is due in large part to the overwhelming support the collection has received from the OHS National Council, OHS officers, and the staff at Westminster Choir College.

Earlier this year, Thomas Riemen Schneider, a graduate student at Westminster, approached me and offered us a small German language, pamphlet-size publication titled, Die Orgel in Gottesdienst (St. Louis, Mo.: Concordia, 1911). I searched the standard bibliographic sources, such as Rudolf Reuter Bibliographie der Orgel, and G. A. C. De Graaf, Literaturver over het Orgel, among others, and the publication was not listed in any of them. There was a rare item of German-American organbuilding ephemera not commonly known by even knowledgeable organ historians. Mr. Riemen Schneider acquired the pamphlet in a second-hand bookstore in Missouri.

Westminster Choir College has hired a new cataloger, Paul Orzeszewski, whose responsibility includes the final cataloging of the books. As of this date, nearly one hundred books are cataloged according to the Library of Congress system. Hopefully, within twenty-eight months, the entire collection of books should be cataloged and on-line.

New periodical titles acquired since the last report include BroadwayJournal (1845-46); The Folio (1869-95); Freund's Weekly (1883-92); Music Trade Review (1875-80); National Peace Jubilee and Festival Reporter (1869); Organists' Journal and Quarterly Review (1874-77); Watson's Weekly Art Journal (1864-1905); and The Western Musical World (1864-95). A number of other titles are on order and should arrive this fall.

Many individuals contribute on a regular basis, and some recent gifts have been received from Agnes Armstrong, Keith Biggers, George Bozeman, William F. Brame, William F. Czelusniak, Joseph DuciBella, Lance Harper Jones, David Junchen, James Lewis, Barbara Owen, James Stettner, Donald Traser, Larry Trupiano, and Richard Weber. We have received several boxes of materials on the Tellers Organ Co. from the estate of Daniel Miller. The most important recent contribution is a large collection of books from E. A. Boadway.

Stephen L. Pinel

RECENT BOOK ACQUISITIONS

Breig, Werner. Der Praeatorium Organ at the University of Freiburg in Breisgau. Stuttgart: Musikwissenschaftlich Verlagsgesellschaft.
Catalogue of the Exhibition/Horticultural Hall/Boston/January 11 to 26, 1902.
Eden, Conrad. Organs/Post and Present in Durham [n.d.].
Emmeron, John. Four Organs: Being the History of the Organs in the Churches of Holy Trinity and St. Peter, Hersham, Surrey. [n.p.].
Richards, H. C. The Organ Accompaniment of the Church Services. London: Joseph Williams, [n.d.].
Reuter, Rudolph. Die Grundlagen des Orgelbaus auf der Irischen Halbinsel. [n.p.].
Worsching, Josef. Die Silbermann-Orgel im Dome zu Freiburg (Sachsen). Rheingold: Verlag zu Mainz, [n.d.].

Richard Lewis contributed his copy of a stereo graphic of the 1875 George Stevens organ in First Congregational Church, Brookline, N. H.
Historic Organs of San Francisco
20 Historic Organs in the Bay Area

A collection of stellar performances from the San Francisco OHS convention are offered on Compact Disc (also cassette) for the first time! So fine were the organs and players that we have taken advantage of the latest recording technology to compile a program of longer than 2 hours duration. Hear Rosalind Mohr's superb playing in fine acoustics on a rewarding Hook & Hastings refurbished for the convention by Kevin McGowan, whose heroic work on the organ was featured in a full-page photograph in Life magazine and in a front-page story in the San Francisco Chronicle. The grand 4m E. M. Skinner of 1924 at Trinity Episcopal Church as played by Tom Hasleton stunningly portrays the Tchaikovsky Andante Cantabile and William Walton's Crown Imperial. California organbuilder Murray M. Harris' instruments are heard in engaging performances by Timothy Tikkens, Rodney Stulken, Rodney Gehrke, and Robert F. Bates, whose performance of Demessieux's Etude in Octaves was "...a highlight of the convention," according to The Diapason.

The recording features many works unrecorded elsewhere, including American composer Henry Morton Dunham's Fantasia & Fugue in D minor that brought the audience to its feet in George Bozeman's performance. Also included is Richard Purvis' Chrétiens, Noël varié, played on the lush 1915 Johnston organ at Église Notre Dame des Victoires by James Welch.

At Grace Cathedral, we hear John Fenstermaker play Dupré's Cortège et Litanie on the enormous Aeolian-Skinner and Randy McCarry give a touching performance of a John Beckwith voluntary on the ca. 1860 organ by an unknown builder there. A small organ built in 1897 by San Francisco organbuilder John Bergstrom is heard in Jim Carmichael's playing of Percy Fletcher's Fountain Reverie. The largest and oldest 19th century trackers in the area are heard, including an 1844 George Stevens played by Lois Regestein and an 1888 Hook & Hastings played by Bruce Stevens. Grand OHS hymn singing is present in good measure.

Included are TWO Compact Discs or TWO Cassettes and a 28-page illustrated booklet on the organs with stoplists and church histories. $22.95 plus $1.50 shipping and handling per order for CDs or cassettes.

ORDER FROM
ORGAN HISTORICAL SOCIETY
Address, see page 2

More Than 2 Hours of Fabulous Listening On 2 Compact Discs or 2 Cassettes

OBITUARIES

Earl L. Miller died June 24 of suicide. Closely associated with the Organ Historical Society since the 1979 National Convention in St. Louis where he demonstrated a one-man Kilgen of 1879 with the "Elks' Danville March," Mr. Miller played hundreds of recitals on old organs, chaired the Historic Organs Recitals Committee 1979-1988, and made many recordings. He played at most of the Society's conventions since 1979 and was to have played a series of at least sixteen concerts in New England between June 26 and August 27.

Having concentrated his talents on church music, he became known as a consummate church musician. His church music programs usually combined youth and adults into a single choir, included a concert series, and fostered special activities for children including Renaissance bands. As an organist, his programs were noteworthy for their inclusion of transcriptions and other works easily accessible to general audiences and were frequently heard on radio broadcasts. His interest in music of the Victorian and Edwardian periods led Mr. Miller to collect and catalog an extensive library of out-of-print music, primarily organ works, but also including choral and piano literature. A specialist in working with artistically gifted children, he had held teaching positions in private and parochial schools and had served public schools as a substitute music teacher.

For OHS conventions, his recitals were unusual and often reflected his innate playfulness. In 1982 he composed Suite Plastique in three movements for pipe organ and two or three plastic, toy, Mattel calliopes and performed the work with Lois Regestein, Stephen Long, and Kristin Farmer at the Seattle National Convention. To his recital at the 1980 convention he brought an ancient birdcage containing the "Birdola" stop from the 1978 Andover organ he designed at Epiphany Episcopal Church, Danville, Virginia, and played it via a garden hose held in his teeth as he improvised on the rebuilt 1883 Steere & Turner organ.

Born June 18, 1946, in Rockville Center, New York, Mr. Miller was reared in New Jersey and Montana. He was a graduate of the University of Montana where he studied organ with the late Lawrence Perry and piano with Rudolph Wendt. Early keyboard studies were with the late Robert Payson Hill of New York City. He did postgraduate work at American University in Washington, D.C., where he was associated with the National Cathedral. He served churches in Illinois, England, Massachusetts, and Virginia and had been organist and choirmaster since 1982 at Christ Church, Andover, Massachusetts. He was appointed municipal organist of Portland, Maine, in 1988 and had been chapel organist 1982-88 at Brooks School, North Andover, Massachusetts.

Mr. Miller left most of his estate to the Organ Historical Society. Memorial services were conducted at Epiphany Episcopal Church, Danville, Virginia, and with 1,500 in attendance at Christ Church, Andover, Massachusetts. His ashes were returned to his parents in Polson, Montana.

David W. Cogswell of West Springfield, Massachusetts, a long-time OHS member, died of suicide on June 7, 1989. Mr. Cogswell, owner of the Berkshire Organ Company in West Springfield, was a registered electrical engineer and was known in the organbuilding trade for his leather supply firm called Pipercraft. His technical innovations included a wind-chest which operates via a fluidic amplifier, for which he received a U. S. Patent in 1969. He recently generated substantial publicity for his application of solar energy to electric organ actions. He was also a member of the American Institute of Organbuilders and the American Guild of Organists.

Keith Chapman, who, since 1966, had presided over the famed Wanamaker organ in Philadelphia, died in late June when the twin-engine plane he was piloting crashed into a mountain in southwest Colorado. His wife was also killed in the accident.
FOR MOST OF HIS SIX DECADES or so as an organbuilder, Thomas Hall was either a partner or an employee. From 1824 to March of 1827, he and his brother-in-law and former apprentice, Henry Erben, were in partnership. After the dissolution of that arrangement, he continued in Erben’s employ until October of 1843. In 1846, he formed yet another partnership with John Labagh, which lasted until his retirement in 1872.

Hall’s organbuilding activities from the time he left Erben until the formation of Hall & Labagh, almost three years later,

Identifying a Thomas Hall Organ

by JOHN OGASAPIAN

are somewhat unclear; at least no instrument or substantive account of an instrument from that era has thus far come to light. By contrast, a number of organs from the other period in his life when he worked on his own, 1813 through 1823, are documented in the periodicals of the time and church records. Such documentation exists, for instance, for the instruments in Baltimore Cathedral (1819-1821) and St. John’s Lutheran Church, Charleston (1823), among others. The two organs cited are both gone; only their cases are still extant. In fact, no Hall organ from that period had heretofore been thought to have survived.

As reported in this journal and in The Keraulophon, there is sufficient evidence—in the case detail and documents—to justify the firm identification of the one-manual organ in Trinity Church, Milton, Connecticut, as an 1823 Thomas Hall, at least four times altered and now restored by Dana Hall.

The Milton organ had been attributed from time to time to William Goodrich, among others; however, usually—and prudently—its builder was listed as unknown. Barbara Owen called it to my attention in 1983 as a Thomas Hall: the only extant Hall organ known. Owen based her identification on similarities in case style and detail with the Charleston Hall, and had advised the parish’s senior warden, Col. Edward A. Raymond, of her opinion.

Attempting to identify, or at least attribute, a case—and by extension, the organ it houses or originally housed—by stylistic detail is essentially the variant of a technique used as a matter of course by art critics and historians. I had suggested and applied the method to a ca. 1831 Appleton case misattributed to the Hooks. Application of the method requires that two conditions be met: first, that a particular detail or characteristic—a piece of trim cut from the same pattern or template, for instance—appear with relative consistency in the work of a given craftsman; and second, that that exact detail or characteristic not appear in the work of another artisan.

Turning again to Appleton by way of illustration (for convenience’s sake; although a Hall organ is the subject of this article, there is essentially by definition more extant Appleton work

Dr. John Ogasapian, Prof. of Music History at the University of Lowell, Massachusetts and a Councillor of the OHS, is the author of Organ Building in New York City, 1700-1900; Henry Erben; and Church Organs. He has contributed several articles to The Tracker and other journals and has served as editor of The Keraulophon.

Now in the gallery of Trinity Church, Milton, Conn., this organ has been identified by the author as an 1823 Thomas Hall through comparison with other examples. Correspondence discovered by Mary Julia Royall corroborates the identification.

with which to illustrate), C-shaped foliations occur on several Appleton cases. That the same trim may not, and indeed does not, appear in the composition of other cases by the same builder, notably (and even surprisingly, given its date and style) including that of the Metropolitan Museum instrument, is of far less significance than that the specific and exact detail designated is not found in any other builder’s cases.

Not to put too fine a point on it, were a case by the Hooks or Goodrich to come to light having C-shaped garlands cut in the
Pipe shades in the form of draperies and the urn on the 1823 organ in Milton resemble those on organ cases known to be by Hall, such as the example built in 1823 for St. John's Lutheran Church in Charleston, S.C., below, and that at Vassar College seen on page 16.

identical design and to the same template as found in Appleton's work, the hypothesis might properly be advanced that a journeyman casemaker had circulated among organbuilders in the Boston area, doing work for two or more of them in turn; or that a single craftsman or shop was subcontracting to build cases for the local organ makers.

Of course, one must be alert to the possibility that a second early instrument might have been placed in the pre-existing case, or that case and organ might be by two different contemporary builders. It is well documented, for instance, that Geib built the case for the 1802 G. P. England organ in St. Paul's Chapel, New York.5 The former situation would probably betray itself on examination of the instrument. The latter situation could well be more problematic, although documentary evidence might provide a necessary measure of cross-checking: in the matter of the Milton organ, for example, Hall's letter in the Charleston archives and Erben's later newspaper advertisement discussed below provide documentary evidence.

The shape of the Milton case is itself extraordinary: four sections rather than the five-sectional common to the era. Side flats rise from end towers to meet not at a central tower but rather at a centered, vertical-frame member, giving the composition an incomplete, truncated look.

The two most distinctive details, for the purposes of identification, are the carved funerary drape pipe shades of the side towers, with their peculiarly designed fringe and fold, gathered at both sides of each tower to a carved rosette, and the flaming urn surmounting the central upright. The urn is missing the flame carving—it was obviously removed when the instrument came to Milton from Litchfield because of the lower height of its new location—however, the piece was discovered behind the case.

The detail design of both the urn and the drape in Milton duplicates that of the case in St. John's, Charleston. The overall composition of the latter is the more normal five-sectional, and more elaborate, as might be expected since the organ it originally housed was substantially larger than the Connecticut instrument. There are central and lateral round towers, and the sloping side flats are divided vertically. Flamed urns identical in design to Milton's surmount both dividing uprights. Similarly, pipes of the side flue—rather than the towers, as in Milton—are shaded with carved drapery identically fringed and gathered to the same carved rosettes.

The clear stylistic relation of the Milton case with that of St. John's Lutheran Church, Charleston, is consistent with the material in the latter church's organ file as brought to light by Mary Julia Royall. The documentary evidence she discovered affirms the Milton instrument as the work of Hall by providing an explicit connection between the two organs, referencing the latter to its original location, St. Michael's Episcopal Church in Litchfield, Connecticut, of which Trinity Church in Milton (a part of Litchfield) was a mission. Its case bears an oval-shaped plate approximately ten centimeters by five centimeters with the following inscription: "Presented for the/Use of St. Michael's Church/By/Mr. Solomon Marsh/1823."
St. Michael's had completed its second edifice in 1812, occupying it on 6 December of that year. Marsh, a cousin of the rector and communicant of the parish, bought the organ for $800 and "placed [it] in the church for use in its services." On the clear evidence, he turned to the leading New York builder of the era.

In 1823, Hall's brother-in-law, Henry Erben, was nearing the end of his apprenticeship and a year later would enter into partnership with Hall. Meanwhile, Erben and the St. John's organ had been dispatched from New York on May 24, 1823—three months later than expected—aboard the coastal vessel Friend. On June 2nd, the ship dropped anchor in Charleston harbor. Only six days later, Hall, who had not yet learned for certain of Erben's (and the organ's) safe arrival, nonetheless wrote, urging him to hasten the installation.

New York 8th June 1823
Dr. Henry

I have not as yet heard of the arrival of the Friend however I make no doubt you are long before the date of this in Charleston and hope the organ is going fast for I begin to want you home again as in that you or myself will have to go to Litchfield . . . .

By July 21st, the work was completed, and Hall was so informed by the church in a letter, the file copy of which is unsigned.

Charleston 21st July 1823
Dear Sir

I am highly gratified in being able to announce to you that the organ has received the unanimous approval of the congregation, and the protracted arrival of Comm. Perry detained Mr. Erben so long from his friends, but our city being perfectly healthy he has no danger to fear. We are very much pleased with the exertions of Mr. E. to afford general satisfaction. His industry and correct deportment, likewise entitle him to our warmest regard and esteem and we trust he will be gratified with his short stay in Charleston . . . .

Church records show a final payment of $303.24¾ to Erben on the 19th. He would have arrived back in New York by the 31st, in all probability, and given Hall's expressed eagerness to complete the Litchfield commission, would certainly have been there installing the organ in St. Michael's by the end of the first week in August.

Nor can the allusion in Hall's letter be to any other organ in that Connecticut city. Mrs. Royall's indefatigable sleuthing uncovered a paid notice from the Charleston City Gazette for 15 June 1824 (p. 3) inserted by Hall & Erben advising their "Southern Friends that having considerably enlarged their establishment" they were accepting orders for quick execution and including a list of thirty-one instruments, the last of them for the "Episcopal Church" in Litchfield, Connecticut; that is, St. Michael's.

The instrument's subsequent move is rather clearly described. Solomon Marsh had retained ownership, and the organ was not actually given to St. Michael's until 1852. Only fourteen years later, in 1866, a committee was constituted to purchase a new organ and authorized to sell the old one for $300. Thus, the organ came to Milton, either by purchase, or as a gift from the mother parish.

There is yet another piece, however, locking the puzzle firmly together. In the Belle Skinner collection at Vassar College, Poughkeepsie, New York, is a five-stop 1865 Hall & Labagh which was, up until 1932, in the home of Joseph L. Priaulx, son-in-law of sometime Hall & Labagh/Labagh & Kemp partner, James L. Kemp. The small single-manual is known to have been rebuilt from an earlier instrument by the firm—or more accurately, its predecessor firm, that of Thomas Hall—and for a time used as a for-loan or for-rent organ by the company. It served Princeton and Governors Island at one time or another. As of this writing, the instrument is dismantled and unplayable; however, plans are underway for its restoration.

The case has two half-towers at each side, added later. The design between them, however, is identical to that of the Milton organ: flats rising from side towers to a central frame upright. The urn that would certainly have surmounted that upright is gone; however, the other details—fringed funerary drape and carved rosettes such as are found on both the Milton and Charleston cases—are present. In addition, a lengthy carved garland surmounting and following the pipe tops of the flats in the Milton case (but not the Charleston) is present in the Vassar composition.9

The Milton case may thus be seen to have been the work of the same hand that did both the Charleston and the Vassar organs; and since both may be shown independently to be the work of Hall, it is at least reasonably certain, especially when reference is made to the Litchfield/Milton organ both in the Charleston letter file and The organ at Trinity Church, Milton, now identified as an 1823 Hall.
1865 Hall & Labagh incorporating facade of earlier Hall organ, now in storage in the Belle Skinner Collection at Vassar College.
newspaper notice described above, that the latter instrument is also the work of Hall, in closer condition to its original state than the others even prior to its recent careful historical restoration.

NOTES
1. See The Lyre I:1 (June 1, 1824), 6.
2. The correspondence file exists in the parish archives.
6. The parish had been founded in 1745 and had built its first edifice in the spring of 1749.
7. See Mary B. Brewster, St. Michael’s Parish, Litchfield, Connecticut, 1745-1954 (Litchfield, 1954), 56. The passage dates the purchase of the organ to “after the new St. Michael’s was consecrated,” but that event did not take place until 3 June 1824, after the organ was placed in the church, to judge by the plate, documentary evidence, and in fact a further quote from Miss Bewster (p. 154): “In 1823, Mr. Solomon Marsh bought a fine toned organ for St. Michael’s. As far as is known this was the first organ in the Society. Before its appearance the pitch pipe was probably the only musical instrument in the churches. Evidently a musician himself, Mr. Marsh, by providing an organ, made a major contribution to a part of the service to which he was especially devoted.”

Keycheeks of the 1823 Hall in Milton are similar to those of 18th century English organs; no other keyboards built by Hall in the 1820s are known to exist.
Phillip Wolfrum's manuscript conducting score of Bach's St. John Passion, movements 18b and 18c (according to the Neue Bach Ausgabe numbering), "Nicht diesen" and "Barrabas aber war ein Mörder," showing the continuo fully realized for organ on three staves.
Two Pupils of Rheinberger and Their Use of the Organ in Performances of Bach’s St. John Passion

by ROBIN A. LEAVER

A T THE EIGHTY-FIRST BACH FESTIVAL, held in May 1988, the Bach Choir of Bethlehem gave performances of Bach’s St. John Passion to mark the centenary of the first American performance of the work, which had been given in Bethlehem on 5 June 1888 by the Bethlehem Choral Union. To mark this historic occasion I was asked to give a public lecture on the afternoons preceding the performance, which had been given in Bethlehem on 5 June 1888

Making use of local newspaper reports, obituaries, and reviews, together with some manuscript letters in the archives of the Bach Choir of Bethlehem, I was able to piece together much of the fascinating story of this historic performance.1

The one piece of evidence that would have given most of the information I was looking for, that is, the conducting score, is apparently no longer extant.2 I was aware that the conductor of the premiere performance of the St. John Passion in Bethlehem, J. Fred Wolle, had studied organ in Munich with Josef Rheinberger. I also knew that another Rheinberger student, Philipp Wolfrum, had also conducted the St. John Passion at roughly the same period as the Bethlehem performance. My reasoning was that the two pupils of Rheinberger might well have had a similar approach to Bach’s St. John Passion, and, therefore, if Wolfrum’s conducting score could be located, then there was the possibility that it could shed some light on the Bethlehem performance.

The similarities between Wolle and Wolfrum are striking. Not only had both studied organ with Rheinberger, but both founded choral societies principally devoted to the music of Bach. Wolfrum founded the Heidelberger Bachverein in 1885,3 and Wolle, the Bach Choir of Bethlehem in 1898.4

John Frederick Wolle (1864-1932) was born into a musical Moravian family in Bethlehem, Pennsylvania.5 His maternal great-grandfather was an instrumentalist, organist of the Moravian Church in Bethlehem, and a teacher. His paternal grandfather, after whom he was named, figured prominently in Bethlehem musical life as a cellist and double-bass player. However, his parents are reported as being devoid of musical talent. A cousin of his father, Theodore F. Wolle, led the Philharmonia Society in the 1870s and was the organist of Bethlehem Moravian Church whom J. Fred Wolle ultimately succeeded.

Fred Wolle was initially a self-taught organist. His father, Francis Wolle, was the Principal of the Moravian Seminary in Bethlehem, and thus the young musician had access to the chapel organ. He subsequently played for services in the Seminary chapel and in the Moravian Parochial Day School, where he would later direct the first American performance of Bach’s St. John Passion. His first organ lessons were taken between the fall of 1883 and the spring of 1884. His teacher was Dr. David Wood, the blind organist from Philadelphia. By this time he had been drawn into choral music and founded the Bethlehem Choral Union, which gave its first performance in the Moravian Parochial Day School on 28 March 1883.

For a number of years Wolle had scrambled and saved by working in Rau’s drug store in Bethlehem and received a small stipend from Trinity Episcopal Church for his services as organist. By June 1884 he had saved enough to enable him to leave for Germany. He studied with Rheinberger in Munich and overlapped with another American student of the German organist—composer and teacher, Horatio Parker, who studied with Rheinberger between 1882 and 1885.5

On his return from Germany in 1885 Wolle again directed the Choral Union, which had been conducted by his second cousin, Theodore Wolle, in his absence. He then conducted premiere American performances of Bach’s St. John Passion in 1888, St. Matthew Passion in 1892 (for which he was instrumental in founding what became the Bethlehem Oratorio Society to supply the second chorus for the performance), and the B-minor Mass in 1900 with the Bach Choir of Bethlehem, founded by Wolle some two years earlier, thus bringing the Bethlehem Bach Festival into existence.

Wolle, one of the founders of the American Guild of Organists, was in demand as an organ recitalist. For example, he played recitals at the Chicago World Fair in 1893 and the St. Louis Exposition in 1904. In 1905 Wolle left Bethlehem to found and head the music department of the University of California but returned in 1911 to lead general musical life in Bethlehem and revive the Bach Festival. Perhaps a little neglected today, Wolle had an enormous influence on the music of this country during the first quarter of the century.

Philipp Wolfrum (1854-1919) received his first organ (and other instrumental) lessons from his cantor father when he was quite small.5 He studied first at a teachers’ seminary in Altdorf, near Nuremberg, where the famous hymnologist, Joannes Zahn, was director, and then at the Royal Conservatory of Music in Munich (1876-78). There he studied organ with Josef Rheinberger and was close friends with another fellow student, Engelbert Humperdinck. Between 1879 and 1884 he taught music at the seminary in Bamberg and directed the Bamberg Music Society. In 1884 he moved to Heidelberg as the director of music at the university, becoming professor in 1898. The year after Wolfrum arrived in the city he founded the Heidelberger Bachverein, which, over the next thirty years or so, made Heidelberg an important centre for music in Germany. Wolfrum—organist, conductor, and teacher—championed not only the music of Bach but also that of such composers

Dr. Robin A. Leaver, Associate Professor of Church Music at Westminster Choir College and the Graduate School of Drew University, is the author and/or editor of more than twenty books, including five on J. S. Bach, and has contributed to numerous journals such as The Organ Yearbook, The American Organist, Bach-Jahrbuch, Early Music, Jahrbuch für Liturgik und Hymnologie, and Musik und Kirche.
Philipp Wolfrum's conducting score of Bach's St. John Passion, the opening of "Betrachte, meine Seele," shows the substitution of "Harfe oder Klavier" for Bach's lute or organ or harpsichord. Photographs of the score are by Anselm Steiger, Heidelberg.
as Liszt and Mozart and gave the first German performances of choral works by Elgar. He was on particularly close terms with Reger, with whom he gave many piano-duo recitals. He conducted all of Reger's works composed between 1898 and 1916, many of them premiere performances, and included Reger's organ compositions in his recitals. Wolfrum was also an influential writer on music, publishing, for example, a study of J.S. Bach and a volume on hymnology.

In these two pupils of Rheinberger, there were these correspondences which led me to investigate their individual approaches to the same Bach work: the St. John Passion.

Since I had to be in Heidelberg in March 1988, I made plans to attempt to locate Wolfrum's conducting score, knowing that it might well be a fruitless search since I had no evidence that it still existed. Through the kind assistance of Frau Annemarie Spiecker, Archivist of the Heidelberger Bachverein, I was able to visit the archives. Within a remarkably short period of time we were able to locate a manuscript conducting score of the St. John Passion. Although it does not bear the conductor's signature, from various pieces of internal evidence, including dates, it is very clear that this was the score Wolfrum used for his first performances of the St. John Passion in Heidelberg on 13 and 14 February 1898 and for further performances in subsequent years.

The manuscript is neatly scribed in ink with various lead and blue pencil markings, indicating dynamics and other details. A notable feature of this score is the way in which the figured bass of the arias is realized. Instead of a written-out, keyboard continuo part, either for organ or harpsichord, Wolfrum composed independent parts for strings or winds, indicating that these movements were to be accompanied by orchestra alone without the support of organ or other keyboard instrument. For example, some arias are given three-part accompaniment for strings—Violsins I & II, and Viola—above the continuo bass-line, and others were augmented with independent parts for two C clarinets. Elsewhere the orchestral accompaniment of the choruses is similarly reinforced by clarinets and bassoons.

The organ parts for the recitatives, chorales, and choruses are particularly interesting. The accompaniment of the recitatives is given solely to the organ, written out on two staves. In the original form the manuscript follows Bach's intentions for the chorales and indicates instrumental doubling of the voice parts. Underneath are three staves for the organ, but they are devoid of notation. It seems that Wolfrum's first thought was to have the voice-parts doubled by both orchestral instruments and organ. While the score was being prepared, he apparently had second thoughts and decided to omit the organ. However, most likely for a later performance, he came to yet another solution since most of the chorales have been marked “A cappella” in blue pencil.

The organ realization for the choruses is much more extensive and fully written out on three staves for manuals and pedal. Significantly, Wolfrum's 1898 performance of the St. John Passion was in Heidelberg University's Peterskirche in which a new, large three-manual Walcker organ, of forty-eight speaking stops with pneumatic action, had just been installed. (See sidebar for stoplist)

Wolfrum's performance of the St. John Passion on 13 February 1898 was the first time the organ was heard in a public performance. The following week, 20 February, Wolfrum gave the first recital on the instrument. The new organ in the Peterskirche, therefore, received its first public hearing in the performance of the St. John Passion, and it is easy to see why the organ was given a prominent role.

Having discovered Wolfrum's performance practice with the St. John Passion, I then returned to my task of unearthing Fred Wolle's American premiere of the work. At first it seemed that German traditions, as represented by Wolfrum, would have strongly influenced this performance in Bethlehem, Pennsylvania, an area with strong German connections. While he was in Germany, Wolle had the good fortune to share in some of the celebrations of the bicentenary of Bach's birth in 1885, in particular a performance of the St. John Passion, with soloists from the Royal Munich Opera company. This made a deep impression on the young man from Bethlehem. On his return to America he planned to perform the major choral works of J. S. Bach, beginning with the St. John Passion. However, it was to take him a further two years before he was able to do so.

When the St. John Passion was eventually performed in Bethlehem on 5 June 1888, it turned out to be a unique rendition, quite unlike the approach Wolfrum was to take some years later. Thus, the proposition I had begun with, that Wolle and Wolfrum might have performed the work in a similar way, proved to be invalid. Instead of the augmented orchestra that Wolfrum used in Heidelberg, in Bethlehem Wolle employed a minimal orchestra of strings, supplemented only by organ and piano. Further, the Bethlehem performance was not a complete one. Instead of the Biblical narrative being sung by tenor and other soloists, it was simply read by a local Moravian minister.

Wolle not only conducted the performance but also played the organ. As could be expected from the American organ pupil of Rheinberger, Wolle had a particular concern about the role of the organ in the work, especially in light of the problems that had apparently been created by the organ at a performance of the Messiah the previous February. This ill-fated performance of the Messiah reveals the immediate background to the St. John Passion performed four months later.
On February 8, 1888, the day after Handel’s famous oratorio had been heard in the Episcopal Church (now Cathedral) of the Nativity, South Bethlehem, a report of the performance was included in the Bethlehem Daily Times. It was somewhat unflattering to say the least, a fairly unusual circumstance since newspaper reports of local enterprise are predisposed to be sympathetic rather than censorious. It therefore needs to be cited at some length:

**THE MESSIAH**

Händel’s "Messiah," as rendered by the Bethlehem Choral Union and Orchestra ... under the directorship of Prof. Wolle, was, musically speaking, a great success, and judging from the almost unanimous approval of the audience, was financially no more satisfactory. ... To make matters short and place the blame where it rightfully belongs, let us jump in **medius res** and say that the failure is due to the organ of the Church of the Nativity. The fact that a large sum was paid for this instrument and the added fact that it was placed in the finest and most elaborate church of the Bethlehem's does not in the least modify the opinion that it is an inferior instrument.

The Church of the Nativity had been substantially remodelled during the period 1886-87 and was re-dedicated on Easter Day, 10 April 1887. A new organ was built by Johnson & Son of Westfield, Mass., a large three-manual and pedal instrument, Opus 672, at a cost of $5,500. The Bethlehem Daily Times reported that William A. Johnson came to Bethlehem in early January 1887 to make arrangements for the installation of the instrument, which would begin on 1 February. The next month the local newspaper reported on progress on the construction and announced that the organist at the inaugural Easter Day service would be none other than J. Fred Wolle.

The criticism of the performance of the Messiah was, therefore, levelled against this new Johnson organ in Nativity Church. Unfortunately no stop-lists of the instrument survive. When it was replaced by the present Aeolian-Skinner instrument in 1941 a note in the contract observed that some pipes from the Johnson organ would be employed, but without reference to composition, rank, or other information. The review in the Bethlehem Daily Times continues thus:

> In the first place, [the organ] is pitched outrageously low about three fourths of a tone below concert pitch, of itself an inexcusable fault and secondly, it is voiced, especially in the middle and lower manual registers and in the pedals, in a most aggravatingly harsh and strident manner, so that the general effect is that it is entirely out of balance. It is totally unfitted for work of the character of the "Messiah." Mrs. Wilson is usually very acceptable as an accompanist, but her work of last night was so ragged and uneven that in a number of instances the effect was anything but agreeable.

> In fact, Mr. Wolle should not have used the organ at all. Had the strings been given the entire accompaniment and at a proper pitch a great deal of uncertainty in the maintenance of pitch by the orchestra would have been avoided. A violinist or in fact any member of its family will simply not submit to being lowered a degree of standardization. Further, "Geib's organs can be seen as paradoxical.”

> Because standardization of concert pitch was becoming a live issue in the 1880s and organbuilders were responding to it in various ways, it is understandable to learn that the strings of the Germania Orchestra of Philadelphia had pitch problems during the performance of the Messiah.

The anonymous reviewer of the Bethlehem Daily Times was also critical of the harsh voice of the organ and specifically mentions that the organist contributed to the problems by choosing inappropriate registrations, as well as playing in a "ragged and uneven" manner.

The performance was clearly an unhappy one and Fred Wolle and the Bethlehem Choral Union had many problems to solve before they could think of performing the St. John Passion. On April 25 Wolle wrote to Mrs. Estes:
A representation of the Moravian Church in Bethlehem engraved in 1877 shows buildings on the church grounds at the left and right.

NOTES
2. There is good reason to believe that Wolle did not conduct from a full score but used a vocal score instead; see Leaver, p. 26.
5. Basic information on Wolle is found in Walters.
7. See my article, "New Light on the Pre-History of the Bach Choir of Bethlehem," forthcoming in the American Choral Review.
10. Maler, pp. 25-26; Steiger, pp. 218 & 231.
12. Ibid.
13. According to the poster advertising the performance of the Passion the organist in 1898 was Linus Breder; G. Morsche, "Die Walcker-Orgel (1898) in der Heidelberger Peterskirche," in Steiger, pp. 96-97.
15. For the details, see the article cited at Note 1.
17. Ibid.
18. See J. Van Varick Elsworth, The Johnson Organs. The Story of One of Our Famous American Organ Builders, ed. D. R. M. Paterson (Harrisville, 1984), 139. I am particularly grateful for the assistance of Dr. John Speller, Reading, Pennsylvania, and Frederick W. Graf, Organist and Choirmaster of the Cathedral Church of the Nativity, Bethlehem, for providing additional information regarding this instrument.
20. Ibid., 8 March 1887.
21. This is probably a reference to orchestral pitch, usually somewhat higher than keyboard tuning, which in England was known as "Old Philharmonic" pitch, approximately A = 454 cps; B. Owen, "Pitch and Tuning in Eighteenth and Nineteenth Century American Organs," The Organ Yearbook, 15 (1984): 55.
22. Bethlehem Daily Times, 8 February 1888.
23. Owen, p. 56.
25. Jeanne Wyne Estes, the wife of Dr. William L. Estes, Surgeon-in-Chief of St. Luke's Hospital, Bethlehem, had a fine contralto voice and was a soloist for Wolle in many choral works he directed for about fifteen years, beginning in the mid-1880s.
27. The statement that the "first complete rendition in America" of the St. John Passion took place in "Bethlehem, Nazareth Hall" (H. Earle Johnson, First Performances in America to 1900: Works with Orchestra [Bibliographies in American Music 4], Detroit 1979, No. 49) is a curious piece of mis-information. "Nazareth Hall" is in Nazareth, some ten miles north of Bethlehem.
31. Ibid., p. 28.
33. Ogasapian, p. 28.
34. Ibid., p. 31.
The most original known organ by Earle is this tonally intact 1906 instrument with a modified case now in First Congregational Church in Island Pond, Vermont.
The New York Organs of George W. Earle
by JUDITH A. SCHNEIDER

ON THE PERIPHERY OF THE MAJOR nineteenth-century New York organbuilders, whose work was known in almost all parts of the country, were a number of builders whose work was of more modest proportions and whose reputations were almost solely local or regional. Some built many instruments, often for residences or smaller churches; others built only a few instruments while they plied other trades or worked as organ technicians. The organs of many of these have completely disappeared, and their histories are rather sketchily documented. One such builder in the shadow of Erben, Jardine, Odell, and the Roosevelts is George W. Earle, whose work in and around New York has virtually disappeared, although he built organs for more than fifty years.

George W. Earle was born on January 1, 1835. Few other details about his childhood are known. He was apprenticed when a boy to the Hook brothers to learn the “art and mysteries of pipe organ manufacture,” for which he was to be paid two dollars a month for four years. The law which “bound” him to his employer was repealed shortly after he became an apprentice. A contemporary account suggests that he also served an apprenticeship with Thomas Hall.

According to the census report of 1860, he was twenty-five years old, married, the father of two children, and living in Cambridge, Massachusetts. His wife, whose age is listed in the census as twenty, had the initials H. C. (This is probably an error since the 1870 census lists his wife as Emma; it was not unusual to name a first daughter after the mother.) and his two children were E[mma] E., a daughter aged three, and a son, G[eorge].W. [Jr.] aged two.

After Earle served his apprenticeship to the Hooks, he began working on his own, first as a pipemaker, then later as an organbuilder. He is listed in the New York Directory as early as 1858. It appears, since he is listed in 1860 Census as living in Cambridge, Massachusetts, that he moved there again for a period of time, perhaps once again working for the Hooks. By 1863 he was back in New York City and by 1869 was well established in his shop in Greenwich Village, as a pipemaker, supplying pipes to Hall & Labagh, the Odell brothers, and the Hook brothers, and voicing reeds for other builders. At this point in his career, he had also made at least twenty-five small organs, the largest being a two-manual and sixteen register organ in the Spring Street Presbyterian Church in New York City. There is some evidence that he worked with a partner during these years under the name Earle and Beale, about whom nothing is known at this time.

Sometime between September, 1869, and June, 1870, Earle moved his business and family to Riverhead in eastern Long Island.

Judith A. Schneider, who holds a degree from Peabody Conservatory and a Master’s in Music History from Long Island University, is a librarian, currently Head of Cataloging and Serials for the United States General Accounting Office, Office of Library Services.
The 1871 Assessment Rolls for the Town of Riverhead, Suffolk County, New York, record that he owned one quarter of an acre of real estate valued at two thousand dollars, on which he was assessed four hundred dollars. The *Sag Harbor Express* (September 22, 1870) reports that “Geo. W. Earle the organ builder has bought a lot of Geo. C. Corwin, at Riverhead, on Fourth St., and commenced building a house,” and on November 16, 1871, the same paper reports that “G. W. Earle is building an Organ Factory 28 x 70 directly opposite the RR Depot, Riverhead” on Farragut Ave. The Assessment Rolls indicate also that his assessment doubled between June 1871 and June 1872, which may include the house and/or perhaps the organ factory.

In the early 1870s, Earle entered a partnership with Ahaz Bradley, who it appears joined with Earle more as a financial partner than a working partner, since he has no known background in music or organbuilding. Bradley was born near Bridgeport, Connecticut, in 1821. He began his career as a teacher and later founded a stationery business on which he built a fortune. He then sold the business and went back into teaching. In May 1862, he began to serve one term as a Democratic member of the Legislature in Connecticut. Bradley then moved to Long Island and was in Riverhead by 1873. After only two years, the partnership, known as Earle and Bradley, was dissolved when Bradley left to help found the Suffolk County Mutual Benefit Society, of which he was the secretary. He also became a founding member of the Suffolk County Historical Society.

While George Earle was in Riverhead, he built organs for the Riverhead Congregational Church, Baiting Hollow Congregational Church, St. John’s Church in Huntington, for a church in Southampton, and completed work in 1871 on an organ for St. Luke’s-in-the-Field (Episcopal) in Greenwich Village, New York City. No records seem to exist at either the Baiting Hollow church or at Southampton about Earle’s organs. The organ at Riverhead Congregational was installed around 1868 when the church was renovated, although the Minute Book of Trustees is somewhat unclear about the organ’s builder, who is listed variously as Mr. Earl and Mr. Earl Fisher. A *Long Island Forum* article, however, identifies the organ as a product of the Earle factory and “installed by Mr. Earle himself.” The organ at St. Luke’s-in-the-Field is from this time as well. Unfortunately, no descriptive records of the organ exist, but a history of the church shows that the organ cost $7,500 and was dedicated on June 8, 1871.

From evidence on the nameplate, “Earle & Bradley 1873,” he also rebuilt the 1845 Erben organ in the First Presbyterian Church in Sag Harbor (The Old Whaler’s Church) during this period. This organ, one of the few known extant examples of Earle’s work, was subsequently restored in 1978 by Mann & Trupiano of New York, who, although retaining some of the stops and the Swell division added by Earle & Bradley, restored the Great to the original Erben stoplist. *(See sidebar.)*

After his time in Riverhead, George Earle moved his family and business to Cold Spring Harbor in Huntington on the North Shore.
of Long Island in 1877. There he operated a saw mill and an organ factory, for which he placed advertisements in the Long Islander (June 18, 1877), a locally published paper. His arrival was heralded by a brief article in the same paper, where he is called a "celebrated organ manufacturer."

Earle’s factory was on the west side of the harbor, on the east side of the second of three lakes on Harbor Road. Built in the 1820s, the building he purchased had been known as the upper factory. The connected upper and lower factories were built by John H. Jones and his younger brother, Walter Restored Jones. These water-powered factories had started as woolen mills: originally, the weaving was done in the upper factory, while the carding and spinning were done in the lower one. The mill was built in the prevailing style of its day: a framed, shingled building of two-and-one-half stories high, with square dormers and the then-popular twelve-over-eight window sashes.10

Evidently George Earle was not only a versatile but an enterprising businessman, responding to local markets and needs for services. In the saw mill, George Earle cut logs for the local shipbuilders from the easily available wood nearby. His advertisements in the Long Islander (June 18, 1877) indicate that he also did general milling and custom sawing. In addition, he tuned and repaired pianos and other instruments. He built organs entirely of locally grown wood, and apparently continued to supply other organ-builders with pipes, particularly reeds, and assisted other builders with voicing.11 He supplied pipework for the organs in many Brooklyn and Long Island churches, probably for other builders. Three reeds in the Miller Organ Company instrument of ca. 1888 in the Sunday School building of Old Salem Lutheran Church in Lebanon, Pennsylvania, are stamped with Earle’s name on the brass shalloots: a trumpet on the Great, the oboe on the Swell, and the clarinet on the Choir.12

While he was in Cold Spring Harbor, he built at least one organ which went to St. John’s in Cold Spring Harbor in 1877. Unfortunately, little is known about this organ except that it was installed in 1877 after some renovations to the church as a gift of John D. Hewlett as a memorial to his sister Phoebe A. (Hewlett) Chase.13

In 1884, George Earle moved for the final time, this time to Hempstead. He lived and worked at 120 Washington Street. By 1906 the firm had become known as Earle & Son. At least two organs were built during this time in Hempstead, one of which stands today as the most original, extant example of Earle’s work. The organ, which bears a nameplate reading Earle & Son, is now in its second home. It is now located in the First Congregational Church in Island Pond, Vermont. The organ was originally located somewhere in New York State and brought to Island Home after being purchased by the parishioners in 1932.14 Although the organ has been placed in another case, it appears to be basically original, tonally.

Earle & Son also supplied an organ to the Cathedral of the Incarnation in Garden City, New York, although no records have been found to indicate whether the organ was for a chapel or an auxiliary building of the Cathedral. He also supplied an organ to St. George’s Church in Hempstead, where he served as vestryman and superintendent of the Sunday School.15

By 1906 Earle was seventy-one years old and probably was at least semi-retired. According to the telephone directory for 1915,
his son, George, Jr., was also working as a piano tuner at 101 Main Street, Hempstead, while his home was at 162 Church Street in Freeport. After 1915, the telephone directory has no listing for George Earle, Sr. (who had been listed earlier), who was now eighty years old.

On May 21, 1918, George Earle, Sr. died at home on Washington Street in Hempstead of heart disease. His obituary in The Long Islander is headlined with "Famous Organ Builder" and the obituary in the New York Times calls him a pioneer in organbuilding. The Hempstead Sentinel of May 23, 1918, reports that, "Surviving Mr. Earle is the widow, Emma E.; two sons George W., Jr. and Raymond; three daughters Mrs. E. J. M. Hamlet of Hempstead, Mrs. Leopold Stanton of Philadelphia, and Mrs. Emma Stanton of Newark, N.J."

The business was carried on by his son, George Earle, Jr., until his death on June 17, 1936.

So little is known to survive from George Earle's career of five decades that it is difficult to evaluate his contribution to American organbuilding. Further research may uncover more information about or perhaps other instruments by this New York builder.

NOTES
5. New York Weekly Review

---

The keydesk of the Earle organ in Island Pond, Vermont, is original though the case is altered. Couplers are by pairs of off/on pistons located at the bass end of the Great keyslip.

Michael Friesen
Photographed in Sag Harbor as it was disassembled, the mechanism of the 1845 Erben/1872 Earle & Bradley shows marked differences in construction techniques of the two builders when examples are closely examined in person. At the right, Erben’s long backfall for the Great key action is a tour-de-force of superior craftsmanship, while Earle’s competent square rail for the Swell key action appears in the right foreground; Earle’s complex Swell action is seen in the pre-restoration photograph reproduced below.

11. A newspaper clipping from the Long Islander, 1935, in church records. See also Soundings, p. 41.
14. Cameron, p. 90. See also Diapason, July, 1918.

Earle’s Swell key action in Sag Harbor is complex, including two square rails, horizontal trackers, stickers, a roller board, and a backfall at the chest, seen at the top of this photograph taken before restoration. The square rail is adjustable and required bracing because of its design.
Howe Barrel Organ Restored at Cooperstown

by KATHRYN BOARDMAN

In celebration of the bicentennial of early nineteenth century American novelist James Fenimore Cooper's birth, a barrel organ which stood in the Cooper ancestral home has been restored to playing condition and is on exhibit in the Fenimore House, the museum of the New York Historical Association in Cooperstown, New York. The floor model, mechanical, parlor instrument was brought from Philadelphia by Judge William Cooper, James Fenimore's father, placed in Otsego Hall in Cooperstown and played often for family entertainment. The Federal style mahogany cabinet with inlaid veneer and brass hardware has gold decorative pipes and bears a maker's label in a front oval cartouche which reads: "Howe / Successor to Mr. Dodds / Musical Instrument maker / 320 / Pearl Street late Queen Street / New York / Wholesale Retail and for Exportation."

According to information collected on New York City musical instrument makers by Nancy Groce and the Organ Historical Society, it is known that William Howe's shop was in operation at the Pearl Street address between 1797 and 1805. These dates also coincide with Judge Cooper's furnishing of Otsego Hall. The instrument is similar in design and construction to English barrel organs of the same vintage. A wooden barrel or cylinder is studded with brass pins or staples which direct levers to open or close the air supply to pipes at the appropriate time for the appropriate durations. The two ranks of wooden pipes and three ranks of metal pipes speak on 1.5 inches of wind pressure created by a bellows with four small feeder bellows on the bottom of it. The bellows and the turning of the barrel are both activated by the action of a handcrank in the front of the case. Five drawknobs for the pipe stops are located on the left side of the case. The operator stands at the front of the case to turn the crank and reaches to the side to make stop selections. Each of the five extant barrels holds pins for ten tunes.

The stops available are also similar to English barrel and keyed church organs of the time. A Flute 8', Flute 4', Principal 4', Twelfth 2 2/3', and Fifteenth 2' comprise the five ranks of 21 pipes each. The compass extends from Tenor D to Treble B. The pipes are neither chromatic nor diatonic but, rather, are arranged in the following special order of pitches: B, C#, D, E, F#, G, A, B, C, D, E, F#, G, A; A, G, D'Tenor.

During restoration by the Chase Organ Company of Worcester, New York, several pencil inscriptions were discovered in the organ's main chest. Signatures by C. D. Pease and C. D. Pease Albertson were made in 1832, 1845 and 1872 indicating repairs of the instrument at those times. Pease is known to have been a Cooperstown piano and organbuilder from the time period. Two of his pianos are in the collections of the New York State Historical Association. Wood samples were also taken at the time of the organ's installation in Fenimore House. Analysis shows the material to be American pine.

On September 10, OHS and AGO members attended a lecture and demonstration on the barrel organ presented by Sidney Chase and Kathryn Boardman. The fifty tunes on the organ's barrels comprise a selection of popular American marches, country dances, hymns, and songs. A limited edition Cooper anniversary cassette tape of most of the tunes is available for $19.95 from the Fenimore Bookstore of the New York State Historical Association, P. O. Box 800, Cooperstown, New York 13326.

Kathryn Boardman, photographer and OHS member, is Associate Curator of the Farmer's Museum in Cooperstown where the museum church contains and maintains an 1847 Giles Beach organ.
MINUTES

National Council Meeting

Richmond, Virginia  
February 17-18, 1989

Call to Order. The meeting was called to order at 1:25 p.m. Present were officers Michael Friesen and David Barnett; councillors James Hammann, John Panning, Roy Redman, Elizabeth Schmitt, Timothy Smith, and Carol Teti; Executive Director William Van Pelt; staff members Stephen Pinel, Tom Johnson, and Jerry Morton (February 17 only), and guest Gary Moore (portion of February 17 only).

Because President William Aylesworth was ill and Vice President Kristin Farmer's travel plans had to be cancelled due to poor weather, Michael Friesen served as meeting chair. It was announced that President Aylesworth had appointed Timothy Smith as Councillor to replace Randy McCarty, who passed away the previous Friday. A moment of silence was held in memory of Randy.

Report of Secretary. The minutes of the previous meeting of October 21-22, 1988 were approved with one amendment (m-Redman, s-Panning, v-unan), and the correct version will be published in The Tracker.

Report of Treasurer. Dave Barnett presented his regular treasurer's report, showing that year-to-date finances overall are performing as budgeted, which was approved (m-Smith, s-Hammann, v-unan).

Report of Executive Director. Bill Van Pelt's report previously mailed was discussed, which covered publications, merchandise and recordings, headquarters convention preparation, and general administration issues, all of which is proceeding normally. Two items of business came out of this discussion. Council moved to "empower the Executive Director to purchase health insurance for its three Richmond employees at an initial cost to the Society not to exceed $190 per month ($2,280 per year) for all three premiums, effective January 1, 1989" (m-Panning, s-Smith, v-unan), uncin also voted to "insert in chapter guidelines a policy statement that local chapter events are to be applauded and encouraged, but should be planned and promoted so as not to compete with national activities and events" (m-Hammann, s-Panning, v-unan).

REPORTS OF COUNCILLORS

Finance & Development. Jim Hammann introduced Gary Moore, a professor at Oakland University, Rochester, Michigan, who compiled the OHS membership questionnaire results and did a statistical analysis of all the quantifiable portions. Dr. Moore presented the results, both in overview and in detail by question. A lengthy discussion of many of the results and conclusions ensued. Rather than presenting them in too-abbreviated form within the minutes, a separate article will be prepared for The Tracker. In other business, discussion occurred about prospects for grants or funding from certain foundations or institutions for projects the OHS would like to undertake.

Conventions. The New Orleans convention plans are well along, and it promises to be a very enjoyable event. Planning for subsequent conventions is proceeding well. Upon recommendation of Alan Laufman, Council moved to "accept the Central Maine proposal for the 1992 convention" (m-Panning, s-Smith, v-unan). Other possibilities for future sites were mentioned. Alan's report was further discussed, whereupon Council voted to "empower the Councillor for Conventions to draft a job description and enter into negotiation with Alan Laufman to formalize a contract for his services as Convention Coordinator" (m-Smith, s-Panning, v-unan).

Historical Concerns. The Archivist's Report was accepted as presented. The Schoenstein firm's records will be microfilmed as per their agreement, and it is hoped that this will then lead to other firms allowing their records to be filmed for preservation.

The meeting was adjourned for the day at 5:45 p.m. The meeting reconvened at 9:25 a.m. the next morning.

The work of the committee charged with studying the proposed new agreement between Westminster Choir College and the OHS for the American Organ Archive was discussed. It was the consensus of Council that more information needed to be gathered and that the committee should continue to study the matter.

Other areas in Extant Organs Lists and Historic Organs citations are proceeding as usual.

Education. All of the committees in this area, Biggs Fellowship, Historic Organ Recitals, International Interests, and Slide-Tape Program are working well, and reports were accepted as presented.

Organizational Concerns. Carol Teti reported that charters for the new chapters are ready to be sent. All other areas report regular conduct of business. Discussion ensued about Council meeting travel expense and the current partial-reimbursement policy's effect on persons being willing to accept nominations for election to council. Council decided to effect a new policy that "retroactive to October 1, 1988 [the start of the new fiscal year], all reasonable expenses needed for Council members to attend Council meetings be reimbursed at 100%. No reimbursement will be made for accommodations, registration, and meals during National Conventions" (m-Panning, s-Smith, v-unan). Council also voted to "cover Dr. Moore's expenses to attend this meeting and to have the Executive Director write him a letter of appreciation for his services" for his work on the membership survey (m-Redman, s-Barnett, v-unan).

Research & Publications. Reports of the Organ Handbook Editor and The Tracker Editor were accepted as presented. In deference to the absence of Kristin Farmer, the report of the Recordings Committee will be held over to the June Council meeting. Bill Van Pelt discussed work being done to produce recordings from the San Francisco convention, as well as on new CD's. Various other publications in process or potential manuscripts were also discussed; the Callahan book is due out this summer.

Based on the results of the membership survey, which indicated that 90% of the members who replied favored retaining The Tracker as the name of the Society's journal, Council voted "effective immediately to revert the masthead style back to the original format" (m-Redman, s-Schmitt, v-unan).

OLD BUSINESS

Michael Friesen raised the point that Council's directive of some time standing to compile a full set of job descriptions for Society positions is not yet completed, and offered some draft descriptions. He also noted that not all committees have yet submitted written operating procedures, something that Council has felt it was important to have done.

NEW BUSINESS

To fulfill a requirement of the Arts Council of New Orleans so that the New Orleans chapter can obtain a grant for programming at the 1989 convention, Council passed a resolution empowering Bill Van Pelt, Executive Director, to sign the necessary papers (m-Redman, s-Panning, v-unan).

The next meeting will be held on Sunday, June 18, 1989, in New Orleans, at a time to be determined in conjunction with the planned convention schedule. Bill Van Pelt will make the necessary contacts to arrange this. There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,
Michael D. Friesen, Secretary
**Program No. 8940 10 / 2 / 89**

Going On Record...the quarterly survey of album releases with commentary from prog**

**Program No. 8941 10 / 9 / 89**

An American Classic...celebrating the 25th anniversary and recent recollection of the famous Aeolian-Skinner organ at the Mormon Tabernacle in Salt Lake City.


RACHMANNINOFF (trans. Flerdelier): Prelude in g, Op. 23, no. 5


LOHMANN: Toccata Variata '82 (on the Pentecost hymn Veni Creator) – Henrik Heimann, o.


**Program No. 8942 10 / 16 / 89**

Sonata Possibilitas... several compositions in sonata form which yield dramatically diverse results, plus other works.


MOORE: Prelude & Fugue – (Sir John Aldrich Organ, Church, Detroit) Raymond Smeeth CD-80104


THOMAS WHalley: Organ Voluntaries; (1983, premier) – David Hurd, o.

HENRY CARLS: Improvisation on Submitted Themes – Gérard Hancock, o. (Ford Auditorium)

All recordings were taped during the 1986 national convention of the American Guild of Organists

**Program No. 8943 11 / 3 / 89**

More from Temple Square...recital performances by resident and guest artists from the Mormon Tabernacle Organists.


Delos D-7CD-3045 (Delos International)

FELIX MENDELSSOHN: Sonata in b, Op. 65. – St. Mark’s Cathedral, Salt Lake City

HELLER: Organ on Denis Browno, fr Sonata for Organ (1945) – Peter Planavsky (1968 Metropolitan organ, St. Mark’s Church, Switzerland) Musica Viva MV30-1092 (Organ Literature Foundation)

HELM, Tenor and Bar Con, fr Sonata for Organ (1945) – Peter Planavsky (1968 Metropolitan organ, St. Mark’s Church, Switzerland) Musica Viva MV30-1092 (Organ Literature Foundation)

**Program No. 8944 11 / 27 / 89**

Mechanic’s Marvel...a tribute to the 1926 H.Hook organ at the Mechanic’s Hall in Worcester, Massachusetts.

RAJA HURIZ: Fantasy & Fugue on B-A-C-H


MARCEL DUPRE: Allegro deesse, fr Evocation – CHASLES MARIE WIDOR: Organ Symphony No. 10 (Romane)

G. EBER: Walpurgischnacht, fr Fanst HENRI MURET: Rosace, fr Esquisses Byzantines

JOSÉ BONNET: Eljes

JOSEPH JONGEN: Toccata

Primary performer is British recitalist Gilian Weir, who was taped during the Fuller International Festival in Worcester in 1983.

**Program No. 8945 11 / 6 / 89**

American Organists in Detroit...a gifted gathering of talent, focusing on the 18th-century repertoire of our native composers, including several premiers.

CATHAL HAMPTON: Trumpet Tunes

DAVID HURD: Partita on Detroit

LEON SOWBERY: Aria (David Hurd) – 1960 (Aeolian-Skinner organ / Ford Auditorium, Detroit)

JAN KOETSJER: Prelude

FRANCIS POULEN: Concerto in g for Out in the Hall

ALEXANDR MANZAKIAN: Pas

**Program No. 8946 11 / 13 / 89**

More from Temple Square...recital performances by resident and guest artists from the Mormon Tabernacle Organists.


Delos D-7CD-3045 (Delos International)

FELIX MENDELSSOHN: Sonata in b, Op. 65. – St. Mark’s Cathedral, Salt Lake City

HELLER: Organ on Denis Browno, fr Sonata for Organ (1945) – Peter Planavsky (1968 Metropolitan organ, St. Mark’s Church, Switzerland) Musica Viva MV30-1092 (Organ Literature Foundation)

HELM, Tenor and Bar Con, fr Sonata for Organ (1945) – Peter Planavsky (1968 Metropolitan organ, St. Mark’s Church, Switzerland) Musica Viva MV30-1092 (Organ Literature Foundation)

ARON COPLAND: Symphony for Organ – Op. 34

HUGO STUHLMANN: Symphony for Organ & Orchestra (with the Michigan State University Symphony Orchestra & Leon Gorgenier, cond.) – Op. 89

ALEXANDR MANZAKIAN: Pas

SACAGA, 1962 – Bernt Ohman, o.

CATHAL HAMPTON: Aria (David Hurd) – 1960 (Aeolian-Skinner organ / Ford Auditorium, Detroit)

JAN KOETSJER: Prelude

FRANCIS POULEN: Concerto in g for Out in the Hall

**Program No. 8947 11 / 20 / 89**

The Heffter Tradition... reminiscences by Viennese organist Peter Planavsky, who plays music of his teacher and mentor Anton Heffter.

PLANAYSKY: Introitus, fr Missa Promissa 1980 (Pfeiffer organ / Brecon Cathedral) MUSICA VIVA MV30-1092 (Organ Literature Foundation)


HUMMEL: Prelude & Fugue in Ak (1945) (org. St. Paul’s Church, Döbling) Presser PPR 135 004

HEFFER: Organ on Denis Browno, fr Sonata for Organ (1945) – Peter Planavsky (1968 Metropolitan organ, St. Mark’s Church, Switzerland) Musica Viva MV30-1092 (Organ Literature Foundation)

VICKERY: Juxta, fr 2 Christmas Songs (O Holy Night; Silent Night) – Robert VICKERY (1976 Aeolian-Skinner organ / Westminster Presbyterian Church, Minneapolis, MN)


GARR: Carols, fr 2 Christmas Carols

**Program No. 8950 12 / 11 / 89**

An American Organ Christmas...

JOHN COOK: Passus on Dinosaur Mysterium – Marran Ruth Messen (1956 Allen organ / St. John’s Alderney, Tulsa, Oklahoma) Metzler CD-1000

SCHMITZ: Toccata in C (College of St. Thomas, 7 / 10 / 89 concert)

**Program No. 8951 12 / 18 / 89**

Seasonal Surprises... somewhat unusual repertoire and real ites from Europe based on Christmas!

REGEL, 3 Christmas Chorales (Macht Ihr Leib), fr Ihr LUDEL, fr Bar Con, fr Sonata for Organ (1945) – Peter Planavsky (1968 Metropolitan organ, St. Mark’s Church, Switzerland) Musica Viva MV30-1092 (Organ Literature Foundation)

REGEL: Chorale-prelude, in dulce jubilo


National Shrine Chorale, CD-2001 (VQR Digital, P.O. Box 302, Needham, MA 02492)

JOHN 3 Christmas Carols (O come, all ye faithful, Away in a manger, Joy to the world) – Joyce Jones (1983 Keston organ, Church, Mobile, AL) CD-701-921-394 (Word Incorporated, Suite 1000, Irving, TX 75039)

RICHARD PURVIS: 2 Carols (Greensleeves, A Scottish Carol) – Lyn Larsen (1924 Paramount Worship Center / Century Convention Center, Washington, DC) Pro Arte CD-282 (Organ Literature Foundation)

VICKERY: Juxta, 2 Christmas Songs (O Holy Night; Silent Night) – Robert VICKERY (1976 Aeolian-Skinner organ / Westminster Presbyterian Church, Minneapolis, MN)

GEORGE FREDERICK HANDEL: Messiah, fr Messiah

SCHMIDT: Toccata in C (College of St. Thomas, 7 / 10 / 89 concert)